

The Urgency of Developing Quality Human Resources in Realizing Good Governance: A Literature Review

Kamal Alamsyah¹, Irwandi², Mas Adi Komar³, Nesan Sujana⁴, Putri Ramadhani⁵, Ajam Mustajam⁶

^{1,3,4,5,6}Universitas Pasundan, Bandung, Indonesia

²UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

Email: apih.amay007@gmail.com

Academic Editor: Nguyen Ngoc Anh

Copyright © 2023 Kamal Alamsyah et al. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Abstract. This article discusses the urgency of developing quality human resources in realizing good governance based on a literature review. Good governance is an important goal in effective and just governance. The development of quality human resources has a central role in achieving good governance. Literature review is carried out by reviewing various studies, scientific journals, and literature related to human resource development and good governance. The results of the review show that the development of quality human resources has a significant role in realizing good governance. Effective human resource development practices contribute to transparency, accountability, participation, quality of public services, and integrity in decision making. Skilled, well-trained and competent human resources can improve organizational performance and make a positive contribution to achieving good governance goals.

Keywords: *Human Resource Development, Quality of Human Resources, Good Governance.*

A. INTRODUCTION

Good governance is one of the important issues in the development of a country. This concept is closely related to good governance, transparency, accountability, public participation, and fair law enforcement. Good governance is basically a concept that has principles that refer to the service process as a functional aspect of government that is effective and efficient in order to achieve community decisions and goals (Cahyadi & Soenarjanto, 2018).

One of the key factors for achieving good governance is the existence of quality human resources (HR). Quality human resources play an important role in driving an effective and efficient government. Quality human resources not only have adequate knowledge and skills, but also have integrity, a high work ethic, and the ability to adapt to changes that occur. Therefore, the development of quality human resources is an urgent need in the effort to realize good governance.

Improving the quality of human resources for apparatus is usually carried out through education and training. Education and training is a process of transformation in improving the quality of human resources for apparatus, where one of the specific goals of education and training is to increase knowledge, expertise, skills, and attitudes to be able to carry out office duties professionally based on the personality and ethics of civil servants according to organizational needs (Sedarmayanti, 2013).

Many research results have shown that good human resource development practices have a positive impact on the implementation of good governance in the public sector, including the results of research by Puri & Tabassum (2018); Yildirim & Şimşek (2019); Adebayo & Yabagi (2020); Khilji & Tarique (2015), Azzam (2018) Smith & Johnson (2019), Brown & Williams (2020), and Firdausijah (2023). Overall, the results of this study indicate that the development of quality human resources has a positive effect on good governance.

The results of this study emphasize the importance of the role of human resources in achieving good governance in various sectors and contexts.

The problem the government is currently facing is the limited quality of human resources (apparatus), this is a phenomenon which is also a major problem faced in administering government in Indonesia (Enceng et al., 2018). Therefore, the development of quality human resources is a national priority. The government has issued policies and programs to improve the quality of human resources through education, training and competency development. However, there are still challenges in realizing quality human resources in all sectors, both in government and society.

The results of Firdausijah's research (2023) show that the problem of human resource personnel in Indonesia is quantitative in nature where most government employees are apparently unable to provide good service, and qualitative which includes recruitment, employee status, discipline and productivity. To achieve good governance, it is necessary to manage the human resources of the apparatus, which includes job analysis, analysis of employee needs, competency tests, an open recruitment system, training and education for human resource development, promotion carried out openly based on performance and increasing the welfare of civil servants. Therefore, according to Akny (2014), reform of human resource management for this apparatus needs to be carried out immediately in order to achieve professional, high-performing and prosperous apparatus to support the achievement of good bureaucratic administration.

This paper aims to examine the importance of developing quality human resources in realizing good governance. This article will provide useful insights for the government, educational institutions, and stakeholders in optimizing the development of quality human resources as an effort to achieve sustainable good governance.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Human Resource Development

Development is a process of how to make an individual or group develop or have strength, ability and have independence in managing a need or dealing with certain problems. Human resource development is a continuous and planned effort made by management to increase employee skill levels and organizational performance (Mondy & Noe, 2005).

Meanwhile, according to Saydam (2000), employee development (Human Resources), is an activity that must be carried out by organizations, so that their knowledge, abilities, and skills are in accordance with the demands of the work they do.

Furthermore, the Canadian Internal Development Agency (CIDA) as quoted by Effendi (1993), argues that human resource development emphasizes humans both as means and as the ultimate goal of development. In the short term, it can be interpreted as the development of education and training to meet all technical experts, leadership, administrative staff.

Sufyarman (2003), said that the development of human resources (HR) is a process of civilizing the nation aimed at improving the quality of Indonesian people who master the knowledge, skills, expertise and insights that are in accordance with the development of science and technology.

Based on the description above, human resource development must be carried out in an organized manner both vertically and horizontally by all organizational functions whose management is coordinated by the human resource management function. Besides that, the development of human resources must be carried out in a planned and sustainable manner, this means that the development of human resources must be carried out continuously and

adapted to developments in the organizational environment both externally and internally to the organization.

Human resources (HR) is a very important factor that cannot even be separated from an organization, both institutions and companies. HR is also the key that determines the development of the company. In essence, HR is in the form of humans who are employed in an organization as movers, thinkers and planners to achieve the goals of that organization. Improvement and Development of Human Resources (IDHR) in government agencies should be able to see the whole, both in the dimensions of outer and inner life (Sulistiyani, 2004).

Sulistiyani (2004), also describes two basic orientations in IDHR which must be applied in a balanced manner, including:

- a. Leading to the quality of the performance of government officials or employees who are closely related to efforts to achieve productivity and performance of the bureaucracy.
- b. Leading to the readiness of the mental and physical condition of employees, which is closely related to the level of full respect for human dignity and worth.

Siagian (2008), provides seven benefits that can be learned from the development of human resources, including:

- a. Increasing organizational work productivity.
- b. Realization of a harmonious relationship between superiors and subordinates
- c. The decision-making process occurs more quickly and precisely
- d. Increase the morale of all workers in the organization
- e. Encouraging an open attitude of management
- f. Facilitate the course of effective communication
- g. Functional conflict resolution.

2. Quality of Human Resources

According to Salim (2014), the quality of Human Resources is the value of a person's behavior in being accountable for all his actions both in personal life and in social and national life.

Ndraha (2015), said that the quality of human resources are human resources that are able to create not only comparative value, but also competitive, generative, innovative value by using the highest energy such as intelligence, creativity, and imagination, no longer solely using raw energy such as raw materials, land, water, muscle energy, and so on.

Notoatmodjo (2017), said that the quality of human resources involves two aspects, namely physical aspects (physical quality) and non-physical aspects (non-physical quality) which involve the ability to work, think and other skills.

Meanwhile, according to Danim (1996), quality human resources are resources that meet the criteria of physical and health quality, intellectual quality (knowledge and skills), and mental-spiritual quality (struggle).

Ruky (2006), says that the characteristics or characteristics of quality human resources are as follows:

- a. Have full knowledge of their duties, responsibilities and authorities.
- b. Have the necessary knowledge related to the full implementation of their duties.
- c. Able to carry out the tasks that must be done because they have the expertise/skills required.
- d. Be productive, innovative/creative, willing to work with others, trustworthy, loyal, and so on.

Human Resources (HR) is the potential contained in humans to realize their role as adaptive and transformative social beings who are able to manage themselves and all the

potential contained in nature in order to achieve the welfare of life in a balanced and sustainable order. According to Tohardi (2002), there are several factors that influence improving the quality of Human Resources (HR), including education level, discipline, work ethic, and motivation.

3. Good Governance

The World Bank defines good governance as a solid and responsible management of development in line with the principles of democracy and an efficient market, avoidance of misallocation of investment funds, and prevention of corruption both politically and administratively, carrying out budgetary discipline and creating a legal and political framework for growth. business activities (Mustafa, 2013). Meanwhile, UNDP defines good governance as the use of economic, political and administrative authority to manage state affairs at all levels (Dwiyanto, 2006).

There are many different opinions in explaining the concept of good governance, so there are also many different understandings about good governance. In general, there are several characteristics and values inherent in good governance practices. First, good governance practices must provide space for non-governmental (private) institutions to participate optimally in government activities so as to allow for synergy between non-governmental organizations and the government, such as civil society with market mechanisms. Second, in the practice of good governance, there are values that make the government work more effectively to achieve common prosperity. Values such as efficiency, fairness and responsiveness are the most important values. Third, the practice of good governance is the practice of government that is clean and free, and is oriented towards the public interest. Therefore, government practices are considered good if they are able to realize transparency, law enforcement, and public accountability.

Based on various descriptions of Good Governance, it can be concluded that Good Governance is a concept that refers to the process of reaching decisions and their implementation that can be jointly accounted for. As a consensus reached by the government, citizens, and the private sector for government administrators in a country.

In the policy document of the United Nation Development Program (UNDP) it further mentions the characteristics of good governance, namely:

- a. Inclusive, transparent and accountable, effective and fair.
- b. Guarantee the rule of law.
- c. Ensure that political, social and economic priorities are based on community consensus.
- d. Paying attention to the interests of the poorest and weakest in the decision-making process regarding the allocation of development resources (Sumarto, 2003).

Various results studied by the State Administration Agency (LAN) in Rosyada (2003), concluded that there are 9 fundamental aspects in the realization of good governance, namely: participation, law enforcement (rule of law), transparency, responsiveness, consensus orientation, equality and justice, effectiveness and efficiency, accountability, and strategic vision.

Pandji Santosa (2008), states that good governance is often interpreted as an indicator of the realization of bureaucratic reform by fulfilling principles such as: accountability, transparency, openness, service responsiveness, decentralization, democracy, justice, responsibility, responsive service, effectiveness and efficiency, oriented to consensus, equality, effectiveness and efficiency, and strategic vision. All of the characteristics or principles of good governance are mutually reinforcing, related, and cannot stand alone.

Sedarmayanti (2013), concluded that there are four main elements or principles that can provide an overview of public administration characterized by good governance, namely:

a. Accountability

It implies that there is an obligation for government officials to act as the person in charge and responsible for all the actions and policies they stipulate.

b. Transparency

Good governance will be transparent to its people, both at the central and regional levels.

c. Openness

Wants to open opportunities for the people to submit responses and criticisms of the government which he considers not transparent.

d. Rule of law

Good governance has the characteristics of guaranteeing legal certainty and a sense of community justice for every public policy pursued.

4. Relationship between Human Resource Development and Good Governance

Many research results have shown that good human resource development practices have a positive impact on the implementation of good governance in the public sector, including the results of research by Puri & Tabassum (2018); Yildirim & Şimşek (2019); Adebayo & Yabagi (2020); Khilji & Tarique (2015), and Azzam (2018).

The results of research by Puri & Tabassum (2018), show that good human resource development practices have a positive impact on the implementation of good governance in the public sector. The results of this study highlight the important role of human resource management in achieving good governance in public sector organizations.

Research by Yildirim & Şimşek (2019), provides evidence that effective human resource management contributes to achieving good governance. In the context of municipalities in Turkey, this research highlights the importance of human resource management in increasing transparency, accountability, participation, and organizational performance.

Research by Adebayo & Yabagi (2020), found that the development of good human resources plays an important role in achieving good governance in Nigeria. The results of this study highlight the relationship between human resource development practices and competency improvement, quality of public services, and integrity in decision making.

The results of research by Khilji & Tarique (2015), revealed that effective human resource management practices have a positive impact on employee perceptions of organizational performance. This study underscores the importance of human resource development practices in achieving good governance, which is reflected in employee perceptions of organizational performance.

Furthermore, the results of Azzam's research (2018), show that good human resource development practices have a positive impact on good governance in the public sector. The results of this study highlight the importance of integrity, accountability and quality of public services in achieving good governance.

The article entitled, "The Impact of Human Resource Development on Good Governance: A Case Study of Developing Countries" by Smith & Johnson (2019), discusses the impact of human resource development on good governance in the context of developing countries. This research uses case studies as an approach to understand the relationship between human resource development and good governance. Overall, this article provides a fairly clear picture of the importance of human resource development in achieving good

governance in developing countries. However, there are some limitations in this study, such as a limited sample of cases and does not include developed countries.

The article entitled, "Enhancing Good Governance through Quality Human Resource Development: Lessons from Successful Public Sector Reforms" by Brown and Williams (2020), focuses on how the development of quality human resources can improve good governance through public sector reform. This research sheds light on the experiences of successful public sector reforms and evaluates how human resource development has played a role in the process. This article provides interesting insights into how human resource development can be the key to improving the overall quality of public services and good governance. However, keep in mind that the focus of this research is limited to public sector reform, so it is necessary to further explore how human resource development can impact good governance in other sectors.

Overall, the results of this study indicate that the development of quality human resources has a positive effect on good governance. Effective human resource development practices can increase transparency, accountability, participation, quality of public services, and integrity in decision making. The results of this study provide an understanding of the important role of human resources in achieving good governance in various sectors and contexts.

C. METHOD

This article is a literature review that is carried out by collecting, identifying, and analyzing various literature references that are relevant to the topics discussed (Creswel, 1998). The literature review approach is used to explore and understand issues related to the urgency of developing human resources in realizing good governance. In this literature study, the main data sources are scientific articles, journals, books, and research reports related to human resource development and good governance.

The research process begins with collecting literature references from various sources such as academic databases, libraries, and online journals. Then, researchers select references that are relevant to the objectives and research topics. The analysis is carried out by comparing, exploring, and concluding findings related to the urgency of developing human resources in the context of good governance.

D. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. The Urgency of Developing Quality Human Resources in Realizing Good Governance

Government agency is an organization that has a variety of purposes. Activities within government agencies are always directed towards achieving predetermined goals, but current conditions show that the human resources of the existing apparatus are still far from what was expected. A portrait of the human resources of the current apparatus showing low professionalism, many practices of corruption, collusion and nepotism involving apparatus, convoluted public services, living in a patron-client pattern, less creative and innovative, working based on operational guidelines and technical guidelines and possibly still there are many other negative portraits which essentially show that the apparatus in Indonesia is still weak.

This description gives encouragement to us to make changes to the human resources of the Indonesian apparatus. In bureaucratic reform, human resources are basically required to be able to provide optimal service to the community through the concept of good governance. Although the public bureaucracy has different characteristics from business organizations, in carrying out its mission, objectives and programs it adheres to the principles

of efficiency, effectiveness and places the community as a stakeholder that must be served optimally. The development of human resources in government agencies must be taken seriously. Good human resource management will have an impact on the stability of government agencies and efforts to achieve the goals and objectives of the government agencies themselves.

Currently, the paradigm of good governance is emerging, for the purposes of a good governance bureaucracy, relevant human resources are needed. When you hear the term good governance, what comes to mind is only the definition of good governance, but what kind of implementation and how it is carried out is still not imaginable. However, in general the implementation in question is related to issues of transparency, public accountability and clean governance. This problem is even more complicated when demands for good governance require changes in various aspects of all systems of governance that have been ingrained for a long time.

Human resource development is a necessity and a strategic step for every local government. An important substance of developing human resources in the face of good governance is a change in paradigm, attitudes, values and behavior of government officials. Development of human resources, directed at efforts to increase the knowledge, skills and abilities of employees to carry out certain activities. Increasing the knowledge, skills and abilities of employees in carrying out the tasks they are responsible for has a direct impact on increasing employee productivity.

Human resource development is not instant or taken for granted, which is accepted and just happens, but should be a learning process, namely with the support of a good learning system. The learning process must continue and be carried out continuously, with genuine sincerity, to position the bureaucracy and all government apparatus to take sides and serve the people.

Development of human resources on a macro basis, is a process of improving the quality or ability of human beings in order to achieve a goal of national development. The improvement process here includes planning, developing and managing human resources (Notoatmodjo, 2003).

The development of skills and knowledge is not in vain, as long as the type of training is chosen appropriately according to needs. In order for the development of training to be sustainable, it is necessary to use a clear and definite pattern of development. Optimization of utilization must be supported by intensive observation, both repressive and preventive in nature, through preventive supervision it is possible to prevent or avoid irregularities in the implementation of work activities, main tasks, functions, policies, work plans and applicable laws and regulations, meanwhile through repressive supervision which is nothing but inherent supervision can analyze and investigate the causes of deviations for improvement.

In principle, efforts must be made so that each personnel is truly professional in their duties, and undergoes a process of maturation, both in knowledge and in the position they occupy. This can be done through a pattern of transfer of duties (tour of duty) or transfer of assignment area (tour of area). This career development rule needs to be implemented strictly and applies to every employee.

It is not easy to change the character and behavior of the bureaucracy in Indonesia, these pathologies are so ingrained in the hearts of government officials and it is said that they have become organizational culture. Aspects of culture, structure, incentives, authority, jobs, positions and positions are among the many other factors that cannot be separated from the bureaucracy. The development of human resources for government apparatus in the public bureaucracy in Indonesia is not the only way to get out of the bureaucratic crisis, but as an effort, of course there are results. The overall effort to improve the quality of the bureaucracy

or government apparatus has actually shown results that are quite encouraging and give hope, but still need to be continuously improved so that a professional and character bureaucracy or apparatus can be created. Efforts like this require a long period of time and continuous efforts towards good governance which is nothing but a change in paradigm, attitude, values and behavior.

In order for the ability of human resources in the organization to be able to adapt to the demands of scientific progress, their abilities need to be developed. In management, the development of human resources as capital must be continuously developed, so as to be able to contribute to the achievement of organizational goals. Only with the right employees placed in their positions and receiving the training, equipment, structure, incentives and accountability to work effectively, is it likely that the organization will be successful (U.S. Office of Personnel Management, 1999).

In the Islamic concept, the basic human potential can be divided into three, namely, the potential of nature, *qolb*, and reason (Irawan, 2020; Sahbana, 2022). This means that the quality of human resources is of course not only enough to master science and technology, but also to develop spiritual values, namely in the form of faith and piety. Human resources that are not accompanied by loyalty to religious values will only lead humans towards the pursuit of worldly pleasures or sheer hedonism.

2. Factors Influencing the Development of Quality Human Resources in Realizing Good Governance

The development of human resources at the macro level is very important in order to achieve development goals effectively, while at the micro level it is also very important in achieving optimal work results. Both macro and micro development of human resources is a form of investment (human investment).

The process of developing human resources is a condition sine quanon, which must exist and occur in an organization, however, in the implementation of human resource development it is necessary to consider factors both from within the organization itself and from outside the organization concerned (internal and external):

a. Internal factors

Internal factors cover the entire life of the organization that can be controlled by both the leadership and members of the organization concerned. In detail, these factors include:

1). Organizational Mission and Goals

Every organization has a mission and goals it wants to achieve. To achieve the goal requires good planning, as well as the proper implementation of the plan. Implementation of organizational activities or programs in order to achieve this goal requires human resource capabilities and this can only be achieved by developing human resources within the organization.

2). Strategy to Achieve Goals

The mission and goals of an organization may have similarities with other organizations, but the strategies for achieving these missions and goals are different, therefore every organization has a certain strategy, so that the ability of employees or employees is needed to predict or anticipate external conditions that can have an impact on their organization. so that the strategy that has been prepared has taken into account the impact that will occur within the organization, all of this will affect the development of resources within the organization.

3). Nature and Type of Activities

The nature and type of organization is very important in its influence on the development of human resources in the organization concerned. An organization that mostly carries out technical activities, the pattern of human resource development will be different from an organization that is scientific in nature, as well as strategies and programs for human resource development will differ between organizations whose activities are routine and organizations whose activities require innovation and creativity.

4). Type of technology used

Human resource development is needed in organizations either to prepare personnel to handle technological operations that are developing so rapidly or perhaps to handle activities that were originally carried out by humans.

b. External Factors

The organization is in the environment and cannot be separated from the influence of the environment in which the organization is located, so that the organization can carry out its mission and objectives, it must take into account environmental factors or external factors, including:

1). Government policy

Government policies through legislation, government regulations, decrees of ministers and government officials, and so on are directives that must be considered by organizations. The policy will certainly affect human resource development programs in the organization concerned

2). Socio-Cultural Society

Any organization established for the benefit of people who have different socio-cultural backgrounds, therefore in developing human resources this factor is needed.

3). Development of Development Science and Technology

The development of science and technology outside the organization today has been so rapid. Of course, a good organization must follow the flow, must be able to choose the right technology for the organization. For this reason, the ability of employees must be adapted to these conditions.

3. Human Resource Development Techniques and the Importance of Evaluating Quality Human Resource Development Programs to Achieve Good Governance

Human resource development and training programs are designed to increase job performance, reduce absenteeism and turnover, and improve job satisfaction. There are two main categories of human resource training and development programs (Decenzo & Robbins, 1999), namely (1) practical methods (on the job training), (2) information presentation techniques and simulation methods (of the job training).

Each category has a different target of teaching attitudes, concepts or knowledge and key skills. In selecting a particular technique to use in a training and development program, there are several trade-offs. This means that no one technique is always good. The method depends on the extent to which a technique satisfies the following factors:

- a. Cost effectiveness.
- b. Fill in the desired program
- c. Eligibility of facilities
- d. Preferences and abilities of participants
- e. Preferences and abilities of the instructor or coach
- f. Study principles

On the job techniques are the most widely used training methods. Employees are trained on new jobs with direct supervision from an experienced trainer (usually another employee). These various techniques that can be used in practice are: job rotation, job instruction exercises, apprenticeships, coaching and temporary assignments.

Techniques of the job, with this approach the trainee employees receive an artificial representation (artificial) of an aspect of the organization and are asked to respond to it as in the real situation. The main purpose of information presentation techniques is to teach various attitudes, concepts or skills to the participants.

Implementation of training and development programs serves as a transformation process. Untrained employees are turned into capable and qualified employees at work, so they can be given greater responsibility (Tubagus, 2015).

Simamora (2006: 282), identifies training and development weaknesses as follows:

- a. Training and development is considered the cure for all organizational ills.
- b. Participants were not motivated enough to focus their attention and commitment.
- c. A technique is considered to be applicable to all groups, in all situations, with equal success.
- d. Participants' performance was not evaluated once the employee had returned to his job.
- e. Cost-benefit information for evaluating training programs is not collected.
- f. Absence or lack of management.
- g. The main role of superiors is not recognized.
- h. Training will never be strong enough to produce verifiable performance improvements.
- i. Little or no preparation for follow-up.

Evaluation is a very important part of the training program, considering that it has spent a lot of time, energy and money on its implementation. To prevent the training from being wasted, an evaluation and follow-up step is carried out regularly. Evaluation of a training program is needed to find out how far the knowledge, skills and attitudes of staff have increased and how much their application has in giving meaning or influence to themselves, their groups and their organization. Training evaluation is more focused on reviewing the training process and assessing the results of the training and the impact of the training related to HR performance.

The objectives of the HR development training evaluation program include the following:

- a. Finding and analyzing information about achieving goals in the short and long term.
- b. Knowing the effect of the training program on the performance of its implementation results.
- c. Quickly identify possibilities for improvement and synchronization of training programs according to the development of the situation in the organization.
- d. Knowing the reactions of participants to part or all of the training program
- e. Know the learning outcomes of participants
- f. Anticipate specific actions when needed to take corrective steps
- g. Knowing the results of the implementation of training and its impact on performance and its problems.
- h. Knowing the opinion of leaders and subordinates of participants regarding the results of the training
- i. Knowing the relationship between the results of the training and its impact on the organization where the participants work.

Evaluation after training at the level of behavior in work is very important, because it is not certain that the knowledge and learning experience gained can be applied in work, but good behavior in work is a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes. Training should be evaluated by systematically documenting training outcomes in terms of how trainees actually behave back on their jobs and the relevance of participants' behavior to organizational goals. According to Simamora (2006), in assessing the benefits or uses of training programs, organizations need to answer the following 4 questions:

- a. Has there been a change?
- b. Is the change caused by training?
- c. Is change positively related to the achievement of organizational goals
- d. Did a similar change occur for new participants in the same training program?

Evaluation requires an assessment of the impact of the training program on behavioral attitudes in the short and long term. According to Simamora (2006), measuring the effectiveness of training includes the following assessments:

- a. The reactions are how participants feel about the program.
- b. Learning is the knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired as a result of training.
- c. Behavior is the changes that occur on the job as a result of training.
- d. Results are the impact of training on overall organizational effectiveness or achievement of organizational goals.

With the measurement of the effectiveness of the training that has been carried out, it can be concluded that training evaluation, both regarding the program and the instructor/trainer, can be used as feedback for further training as well as for their learning whether they learn the principles, skills and facts that they should learn. Furthermore, it is possible to find out whether the participant's behavior has changed due to the training program or not. Finally, by looking at the results of the training whether they are in accordance with the training objectives set.

E. CONCLUSION

The results of the review show that the development of quality human resources has a significant role in realizing good governance. Effective human resource development practices contribute to transparency, accountability, participation, quality of public services, and integrity in decision making. Skilled, well-trained and competent human resources can improve organizational performance and make a positive contribution to achieving good governance goals.

REFERENCES

1. Adebayo, S. B., & Yabagi, J. A. (2020). Human Resource Development and Good Governance: Evidence from Nigeria. *European Journal of Business and Management Research*, 5(4), 21-29.
2. Akny, A. B. (2014). Mewujudkan Good Governance melalui Reformasi Birokrasi di Bidang SDM Aparatur untuk Peningkatan Kesejahteraan Pegawai. *Jejaring Administrasi Publik*, 6(1), 416-427.
3. Azzam, A. M. (2018). The Impact of Human Resource Development Practices on Good Governance in the Public Sector. *Journal of Public Administration, Finance and Law*, (14), 51-63.
4. Brown, A. P., & Williams, R. S. (2020). Enhancing Good Governance through Quality Human Resource Development: Lessons from Successful Public Sector Reforms. *Journal of Public Management*, 55(2), 143-158.

5. Cahyadi, A., & Soenarjanto, B. (2018). Penerapan Good Governance Dalam Pelayanan Publik (Studi Tentang Kualitas Pelayanan Elektronik Kartu Tanda Penduduk Berbasis Good Governance di Kecamatan Sukolilo Surabaya). *JPAP: Jurnal Penelitian Administrasi Publik*, 4(1), 750-756.
6. Creswel, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design*. SAGE: Thousand Oaks.
7. Danim, S. (1995). *Transformasi Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
8. Dwiyanto, A. (2006). *Reformasi Birokrasi Publik di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University Press.
9. Enceng, E., Liestyodono, B. I., & Purwaningdyah, M. W. (2008). Meningkatkan kompetensi aparatur pemerintah daerah dalam mewujudkan good governance. *Civil Service Journal*, 2(1), 33-43.
10. Firdausijah, R. T. (2023). Management of State Civil Apparatus Human Resources in An Effort to Realize Good Governance. *Jurnal Ekonomi*, 11(2), 1651-1655.
11. Irawan, H. (2020). Hakikat Sumber Daya (Fitrah, Akal, Qalb, dan Nafs) Manusia dalam Pendidikan Islam dan Pengembangannya dan Relevansinya dengan Pendidikan Islam Kontemporer. *Turast: Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengabdian*, 8(1), 17-31.
12. Khilji, S. E., & Tarique, I. (2015). Impact of Human Resource Management Practices on Employee's Perceptions of Organizational Performance: Empirical Evidence from Pakistan. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 7(2), 14-22.
13. Mustafa, D. (2013). *Birokrasi Pemerintah*. Makasar: Alfabeta.
14. Ndraha, T. (2015). *Pengantar Teori Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
15. Notoatmodjo, S. (2017). *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
16. Puri, A., & Tabassum, R. (2018). Impact of Human Resource Development Practices on Good Governance in Public Sector Organizations. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 8(1), 98-110.
17. Rosyada, D. (2003). *Demokrasi, Hak Asasi Manusia, dan Masyarakat Madani*. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
18. Ruky, A. S. (2003). *SDM berkualitas mengubah visi menjadi realitas*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
19. Sahbana, M. D. R. (2022). Hakikat Sumber Daya (Fitrah, Akal, Qalb, dan Nafs) Manusia dalam Pendidikan Islam. *Journal of Counseling Education and Society*, 3(2), 1-6.
20. Salim, E. (2014). *Aspek Sikap Mental dalam Manajemen sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
21. Santosa, P. (2008). *Administrasi Publik (Teori dan Aplikasi Good Governance)*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
22. Sedarmayanti. (2013). *Reformasi Administrasi Publik. Reformasi Birokrasi, dan Kepemimpinan Masa Depan (Mewujudkan Pelayanan Prima dan Kepemerintahan yang Baik)*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
23. Siagian, S. P. (2008). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
24. Simamora, H. (2006). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bogor: Ghalia Indonesia.
25. Smith, J. K., & Johnson, L. M. (2019). The Impact of Human Resource Development on Good Governance: A Case Study of Developing Countries. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 45(3), 275-291.
26. Sulistyani, A. T. (2004). *Memahami Good Governance (Dalam Perspektif Sumber Daya Manusia)*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media.
27. Sumarto, H. S. (2003). *Inovasi, Partisipasi dan Good Governance: 20 Prakarsa Inovatif dan Partisipatif di Indonesia*. Bandung: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.

28. Tohardi, A. (2002). *Pemahaman Praktis Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: Mandar Maju.
29. U.S. Office of Personnel Management. (1999). *Strategic Human Resources Management*. Washington, D.C: U.S. Office of Personnel Management.
30. Yildirim, N., & Şimşek, H. (2019). The Role of Human Resources Management in Achieving Good Governance: A Study on Municipalities in Turkey. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 14(3), 87-99.
31. Zainun, B. (2001). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Indonesia*. Jakarta: Gunung Agung.